# CHAPTER 1

# **Conditions of Uniform Convergence**

#### 1.1 Pointwise, Absolute, and Uniform Convergence. Convergence on a Set and Subset

**Example 1.** A function f(x, y), defined on  $X \times Y$ , has a limit for any fixed  $x \in$ X as y approaches  $y_0$ , that is, f(x, y) converges pointwise to a limit function  $\varphi(x)$ as *y* approaches  $y_0$ , but the convergence of f(x, y) to  $\varphi(x)$  is nonuniform on *X*.

#### Solution

Let us consider  $f(x, y) = \frac{xy}{x^2+y^2}$  defined on  $[0, 1] \times (0, 1]$  and choose  $y_0 = 0$ . If x = 0, then f(0, y) = 0 and consequently  $\lim_{y \to 0} f(0, y) = \lim_{y \to 0} 0 = 0$ . If  $x \neq 0$ , then  $\lim_{y \to 0} f(x, y) = \lim_{y \to 0} \frac{xy}{x^2+y^2} = 0$ . Therefore, the limit function is defined for any  $x \in [0, 1]$  and it is zero:  $\varphi(x) = \lim_{y \to 0} f(x, y) = 0$ . However, the convergence to  $\varphi(x)$ is not uniform on X = [0, 1]. Indeed for  $\forall y \in Y = (0, 1]$ , there exists  $x_y = y \in$ (0,1] such that

$$|f(x_y, y) - \varphi(x_y)| = \frac{y^2}{2y^2} = \frac{1}{2} \underset{y \to 0}{\not \rightarrow} 0,$$

that is, for  $\varepsilon_0 = \frac{1}{2}$  whatever radius  $\delta$  is chosen, there exists the point  $x_y = y \in$ (0, 1] such that  $|f(x_y, y) - \varphi(x_y)| = \frac{y^2}{2y^2} \ge \varepsilon_0$  although  $|y| < \delta$ . It means that the convergence is not uniform.

*Remark 1.* In the case of  $Y = \mathbb{N}$ , a similar example can be formulated as follows: a sequence of functions  $f_n(x)$  converges (pointwise) on a set X, but this convergence is nonuniform. One of the counterexamples is  $f_n(x) = x^n$ , X = (-1, 1). Since |x| < 1, one gets  $\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} x^n = 0 = f(x)$ ,  $\forall x \in X$ . To show that this convergence is nonuniform, let us pick up  $x_n = \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right) \in X$ , for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, n \ge 2$ ; and for these points, we obtain

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^n \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} e^{-1} \neq 0.$$

Counterexamples on Uniform Convergence: Sequences, Series, Functions, and Integrals, First Edition. Andrei Bourchtein and Ludmila Bourchtein.

<sup>© 2017</sup> John Wiley & Sons, Inc. Published 2017 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Companion website: www.wiley.com/go/bourchtein/counterexamples\_on\_uniform\_convergence



**Figure 1.1** Examples 1, 4, and 28, sequence  $f_n(x) = x^n$ .

In other words, for  $\varepsilon_0 = \frac{1}{4}$  whatever natural number N is chosen, for some (in this case, actually, for any)  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $n \ge 2$ , there exists the point  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n}$  such that  $|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^n \ge \frac{1}{4}$ , that is, the convergence is not uniform. (In the last inequality, we have used the fact that the sequence  $\left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^n$  is increasing.)

*Remark* 2. A similar formulation can be made in the case of series: a series of functions converges (pointwise) on a set, but this convergence is nonuniform. The respective counterexample can be given with the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n$ ,  $x \in X = (-1, 1)$ . It is well known that the geometric series is convergent for |x| < 1 and  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n = \frac{1}{1-x} = f(x)$ . To analyze the character of this convergence, first let us find the partial sums  $f_n(x) = \sum_{k=0}^n x^k = \frac{1-x^{n+1}}{1-x}$  and the corresponding remainders  $r_n(x) = f(x) - f_n(x) = \frac{x^{n+1}}{1-x}$ . Choosing now  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n+1}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , we obtain

$$r_n(x_n) = \frac{\left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^n}{1 - 1 + \frac{1}{n+1}} = (n+1)\left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^{n+1} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} \infty.$$

Therefore, the convergence is nonuniform.



**Figure 1.2** Examples 1 and 4, series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n$ .

**Example 2.** A series of functions converges on *X* and a general term of the series converges to zero uniformly on *X*, but the series converges nonuniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Let us consider the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  on X = [0, 1). This series converges for  $\forall x \in X$ , because  $0 \le \frac{x^n}{n} \le x^n$ ,  $\forall n$ , and the geometric series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^n$  is convergent for |x| < 1. We can even find the sum of the series if we recall that the function ln (1 + x) has expansion in Taylor's series ln  $(1 + x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^{n-1} \frac{x^n}{n}$  convergent on (-1, 1]. Then, replacing x by -x, we obtain ln  $(1 - x) = -\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  with convergence on [-1, 1) and, in particular, on X = [0, 1). Further, the general term  $u_n(x) = \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges to 0 uniformly on X = [0, 1), because  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1}{n} = 0$  and evaluation  $|u_n(x)| = \frac{|x|^n}{n} < \frac{1}{n}$  holds for  $\forall x \in X$ . Hence, the conditions of the statement are satisfied. However, the series is not convergent uniformly on X that can be shown by verifying the Cauchy criterion of the uniform convergence. In fact, for  $\forall x \in X$  and for  $\forall n, p \in \mathbb{N}$  we have the following evaluation:

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} \frac{x^k}{k}\right| = \frac{x^{n+1}}{n+1} + \dots + \frac{x^{n+p}}{n+p} > p\frac{x^{n+p}}{n+p}.$$





**Figure 1.3** Examples 2, 26, 27, and 30, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$ .

Now, for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , choosing  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \frac{1}{\sqrt[n]{2}} \in X$ , we get  $\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt[n]{2}}\right)^{2n}$ 

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} \frac{x_n^k}{k}\right| > n \frac{\left(1/\sqrt[n]{2}\right)}{2n} = \frac{1}{8} \underset{n \to \infty}{\xrightarrow{\to}} 0.$$

which means that the Cauchy criterion is not satisfied and, therefore, the series does not converge uniformly on *X*.

*Remark 1.* The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  considered on X = (-1, 1) provides a similar counterexample. First, it converges for  $\forall x \in X$ , because  $0 \le \left|\frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}\right| \le |x|^n$ ,  $\forall n$ , and the geometric series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} |x|^n$  is convergent for |x| < 1. Second, the inequality  $|u_n(x)| = \left|\frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}\right| < \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$  holds for  $\forall x \in X$ ; since  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} = 0$ , it implies the uniform convergence of  $\frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  to 0 on *X*. Hence, the statement conditions hold. To analyze the nature of the convergence of the series, let us evaluate the sum  $\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} \frac{x^k}{\sqrt{k}}$  for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $p_n = n$ , and  $x_n = \frac{1}{\sqrt[p]{3}} \in X$ :

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} \frac{x_n^k}{\sqrt{k}}\right| > n \frac{\left(1/\sqrt[n]{3}\right)^{2n}}{\sqrt{2n}} = \frac{1}{9\sqrt{2}} \sqrt{n} \mathop{\to}\limits_{n \to \infty} \infty.$$

This means that the Cauchy criterion is not satisfied and, therefore, the series does not converge uniformly on *X*.

*Remark 2.* The converse general statement is true: if a series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, then its general term converges to zero uniformly on *X*.

**Example 3.** A sequence of functions converges on *X* and there exists its subsequence that converges uniformly on *X*, but the original sequence does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Let us consider the sequence  $f_n(x) = \begin{cases} \frac{x}{n}, n = 2k - 1\\ \frac{1}{n}, n = 2k \end{cases}$ ,  $\forall k \in \mathbb{N}, X = \mathbb{R}$ . For any fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , we have two partial limits: if n = 2k - 1, then  $\lim_{k \to \infty} f_{2k-1}(x) = \lim_{k \to \infty} \frac{x}{2k-1} = 0$ ; and if n = 2k, then  $\lim_{k \to \infty} f_{2k}(x) = \lim_{k \to \infty} \frac{1}{2k} = 0$ . Therefore, this sequence converges to 0 on  $\mathbb{R}$ :  $\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = 0 = f(x)$ . Note also that the subsequence  $f_{2k}(x)$  converges uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$ , since the same evaluation  $|f_{2k}(x) - f(x)| < \varepsilon$  holds simultaneously for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ . Or equivalently, for  $\forall \varepsilon > 0$  there exists  $K_{\varepsilon} = \left[\frac{1}{2\varepsilon}\right]$  such that for  $\forall k > K_{\varepsilon}$  and simultaneously for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  it follows that  $|f_{2k}(x) - f(x)| < \varepsilon$ . That is, the definition of the uniform convergence is satisfied for  $f_{2k}(x)$ . Nevertheless, the sequence  $f_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$ . Indeed, whatever large index N we choose, there exists the index  $n_N = 2N - 1 > N$  and the real point  $x_N = 2N - 1$  such that

$$|f_{2N-1}(x_N) - f(x_N)| = \frac{2N-1}{2N-1} = 1 \underset{N \to \infty}{\xrightarrow{\rightarrow}} 0.$$

Hence, the convergence of  $f_n(x)$  is not uniform on  $\mathbb{R}$ .

**Example 4.** A function f(x, y) defined on  $(a, b) \times Y$  converges to a limit function  $\varphi(x)$  as y approaches  $y_0$ , and this convergence is uniform on any interval  $[c, d] \subset (a, b)$ , but the convergence is nonuniform on (a, b).

#### Solution

We can employ here the same functions used in Example 1. First, we consider  $f(x, y) = \frac{xy}{x^2+y^2}$  defined on  $(0, 1) \times (0, 1)$  and choose  $y_0 = 0$ . As in Example 1, the limit function is zero:  $\varphi(x) = \lim_{y \to 0} f(x, y) = 0$ ,  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ . However, the convergence to  $\varphi(x)$  is not uniform on (0, 1), because for  $\forall y \in (0, 1)$  there exists  $x_y = y$  such that

$$|f(x_y, y) - \varphi(x_y)| = \frac{y^2}{2y^2} = \frac{1}{2} \underset{y \to 0}{\xrightarrow{\leftrightarrow}} 0.$$

5

On the other hand, for any interval  $[c, d] \subset (0, 1)$ , the convergence is uniform. Indeed, for all  $x \in [c, d]$  and for any y > 0, it follows that

$$|f(x,y) - \varphi(x)| = \frac{xy}{x^2 + y^2} \le \frac{xy}{x^2} \le \frac{1}{c}y.$$

Therefore, for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\delta_{\varepsilon} = c\varepsilon > 0$  (which is the same for all points in [c, d]) such that if  $0 < y < \delta$ , then  $|f(x, y) - \varphi(x)| \le \frac{1}{c}y < \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in [c, d]$  simultaneously. It means that the convergence is uniform on [c, d].

Remark 1. The sequence  $f_n(x) = x^n$  on  $x \in (-1, 1)$  from Example 1 provides the following counterexample: a sequence of functions  $f_n(x)$ , defined on (a, b), converges uniformly on any interval  $[c, d] \subset (a, b)$ , but the convergence is nonuniform on (a, b). The fact that the convergence to the limit function f(x) = 0 is not uniform on (-1, 1) was already proved in Example 1. Let us show that the convergence is uniform on any  $[c, d] \subset (-1, 1)$ . Since we can always construct the interval [-q, q], where  $q = \max\{|c|, |d|\}$ , such that  $[c, d] \subset [-q, q] \subset (-1, 1)$ , it is sufficient to prove the uniform convergence on [-q, q]. For this interval, we get  $|f_n(x) - f(x)| = |x^n| \le q^n$ , for all  $x \in [-q, q]$  at the same time. Since  $\lim_{n \to \infty} q^n = 0$ , that is, for any  $\varepsilon > 0$  (it is sufficient to consider  $\varepsilon < 1$ ), there exists  $N_{\varepsilon} = \left[\frac{\ln \varepsilon}{\ln q}\right]$  such that  $q^n < \varepsilon$  if  $n > N_{\varepsilon}$ , we can conclude that for any  $\varepsilon > 0$  there exists exactly the same  $N_{\varepsilon} = \left[\frac{\ln \varepsilon}{\ln q}\right]$  such that when  $n > N_{\varepsilon}$ , then  $|x^n| \le q^n < \varepsilon$  for all  $x \in [-q, q]$  simultaneously. The last sentence is the definition of the uniform convergence on [-q, q].

*Remark 2.* Finally, the series of Example 1  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n$ ,  $x \in (-1, 1)$  is an example of the situation when a series of functions converges uniformly on any interval  $[c, d] \subset (a, b)$ , but the convergence is nonuniform on (a, b). It was already shown in Example 1 that the convergence of the given series is not uniform on (-1, 1). Let us consider an interval  $[-q, q] \subset (-1, 1)$ , q > 0 and show that the convergence on any interval  $[c, d] \subset (-1, 1)$ . Since  $|x^n| \leq q^n$  for any  $x \in [-q, q]$  and the numerical series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} q^n$  is convergent (the geometrical series with |q| < 1), according to the Weierstrass test the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n$  converges uniformly on [-q, q].

*Remark 3.* The nearly converse situation also takes place, as it is shown in Example 5.

**Example 5.** A sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges on X, but this convergence is nonuniform on a closed interval  $[a, b] \subset X$ .

### Solution

One of the counterexamples is  $f_n(x) = nxe^{-n^2x^2}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ . It is easy to show that this sequence approaches  $f(x) \equiv 0$  on  $\mathbb{R}$ . In fact, for x = 0 one has  $f_n(0) = 0$ ,  $\forall n$ and, consequently,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} f_n(0) = 0$ . For  $x \neq 0$ , one can use the change of variable t = nx and apply l'Hospital's rule:

$$\lim_{n\to\infty}f_n(x)=\lim_{t\to\pm\infty}\frac{t}{e^{t^2}}=\lim_{t\to\pm\infty}\frac{1}{2te^{t^2}}=0.$$

Consider now  $[a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$  such that  $a \leq 0 < b$ . Choosing  $N > \frac{1}{b}$  and  $x_n = \frac{1}{b}$ , one obtains the following evaluation for  $\forall n > N$ :

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = n|x_n|e^{-n^2x_n^2} = e^{-1} \underset{k \to \infty}{\not \to} 0,$$

which means that the convergence of  $f_{\mu}(x)$  to 0 is nonuniform on such a closed interval.

*Remark 1.* A similar example for a series goes as follows: a series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges on a set X, but this series does not converge uniformly on a closed subinterval  $[a, b] \subset X$ . The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{n}$  provides an example. First, we show that it is convergent on  $\mathbb{R}$ . If  $x_k = k\pi$ ,  $\forall k \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx_k}{n} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 0 = 0$ . For  $x \neq k\pi$ , we can apply Dirichlet's theorem. For the partial sums  $B_n(x) =$  $\sum_{k=1}^{n} \sin kx$ , the following evaluation holds:

$$|B_{n}(x)| = \left| \frac{1}{2\sin\frac{x}{2}} \sum_{k=1}^{n} 2\sin kx \sin\frac{x}{2} \right|$$
  
=  $\left| \frac{1}{2\sin\frac{x}{2}} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \left( \cos\left(k - \frac{1}{2}\right)x - \cos\left(k + \frac{1}{2}\right)x \right) \right|$   
=  $\frac{1}{2\left|\sin\frac{x}{2}\right|} \left| \cos\frac{x}{2} - \cos\left(n + \frac{1}{2}\right)x \right|$   
=  $\frac{1}{2\left|\sin\frac{x}{2}\right|} \left| 2\sin\frac{n+1}{2}x \cdot \sin\frac{n}{2}x \right| \le \frac{1}{\left|\sin\frac{x}{2}\right|}$ 

(note that the division by  $\sin \frac{x}{2}$  is possible, since  $x \neq k\pi$ ). Therefore, the sums  $B_n(x)$  are bounded for any fixed  $x \neq k\pi$ . Besides, the numerical sequence  $c_n = \frac{1}{n}$  is decreasing and approaches 0 as  $n \to \infty$ . Hence, all the conditions of Dirichlet's theorem are satisfied, and therefore the series is convergent on  $\mathbb{R}$ .

Let us show that this convergence is nonuniform on  $(0, 2\pi)$  (and consequently on  $[0, 2\pi]$  or any other interval containing  $(0, 2\pi)$ ). To this end, we evaluate the sum  $\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} u_k(x_n) = \sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} \frac{\sin kx_n}{k}$  in the Cauchy criterion of uniform convergence. Choosing in this sum  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \frac{\pi}{6n}$ , noting that  $\frac{\pi}{6} < kx_n \le \frac{\pi}{3}$ 

for any *k* such that  $n < k \le n + p_n = 2n$ , and recalling that sin *t* is positive and strictly increasing on  $\left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right)$ , we obtain

$$\begin{vmatrix} n+p_n \\ \sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k(x_n) \end{vmatrix} = \left| \sum_{k=n+1}^{2n} \frac{\sin kx_n}{k} \right|$$
$$= \frac{\sin \left(\frac{\pi}{6} + \frac{\pi}{6n}\right)}{n+1} + \frac{\sin \left(\frac{\pi}{6} + \frac{2\pi}{6n}\right)}{n+2} + \dots + \frac{\sin \frac{\pi}{3}}{2n}$$
$$> \frac{\sin \frac{\pi}{6}}{n+1} + \frac{\sin \frac{\pi}{6}}{n+2} + \dots + \frac{\sin \frac{\pi}{6}}{2n}$$
$$= \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{n+1} + \dots + \frac{1}{2n} \right) > \frac{1}{2} \frac{n}{2n} = \frac{1}{4}.$$

Hence, there exists  $\varepsilon_0 = \frac{1}{4}$  such that for  $\forall n$  there are  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \frac{\pi}{6n} \in$  $(0, 2\pi)$  such that  $\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k(x_n)\right| > \varepsilon_0$ . This means that the Cauchy criterion is not satisfied on  $(0, 2\pi)$  and, consequently, the series does not converge uniformly on this interval.

At the same time, the application of Dirichlet's theorem of uniform convergence reveals that the series converges uniformly on the interval  $[a, 2\pi - a]$  for any  $a \in (0, \pi)$ . Indeed, since  $\sin \frac{x}{2} > 0$ ,  $\forall x \in [a, 2\pi - a]$ , we can apply the same evaluations as above for the partial sums  $B_n(x) = \sum_{k=1}^n \sin kx$  to obtain

$$|B_n(x)| \le \frac{1}{|\sin x/2|} = \frac{1}{\sin x/2} \le \frac{1}{\sin a/2}, \quad \forall x \in [a, 2\pi - a],$$

that is, the sums  $B_n(x)$  are uniformly bounded on  $[a, 2\pi - a]$ . Since  $c_n = \frac{1}{n} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0$ and  $c_n$  is strictly decreasing, all the conditions of Dirichlet's theorem of uniform convergence are satisfied. Hence, the series converges uniformly on any interval  $[a, 2\pi - a], a \in (0, \pi).$ 

Remark 2. For functions depending on a parameter, the corresponding formulation is as follows: a function f(x, y) defined on  $X \times Y$  has a limit  $\lim f(x, y) =$  $\varphi(x)$  for  $\forall x \in X$ , but f(x, y) converges to  $\varphi(x)$  nonuniformly on a subinterval  $[a, b] \subset X$ . The function  $f(x, y) = \frac{x^2 y^2}{x^4 + y^4}$  considered on  $\mathbb{R} \times (0, +\infty)$  with the limit point  $y_0 = 0$  provides the counterexample. This function converges to  $\varphi(x) \equiv$ 0 on  $\mathbb{R}$  as  $y \to 0$ : for x = 0, one has f(0, y) = 0,  $\forall y \in (0, +\infty)$  which implies  $\lim_{x \to 0} f(0, y) = 0$ ; and for  $x \neq 0$ , one obtains by the arithmetic rules of the limits  $\lim_{y \to 0} \frac{x^2 y^2}{x^4 + y^4} = \frac{0}{x^4} = 0$ . Choose now  $[a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$  such that  $a \le 0 < b$  and evaluate the difference  $|f(x, y) - \varphi(x)|$  for  $\forall y \in (0, b)$  and  $x_y = y \in [a, b]$ :

$$|f(x_y, y) - \varphi(x_y)| = \frac{y^4}{2y^4} = \frac{1}{2} \underset{y \to 0}{\not \rightarrow} 0.$$

This result shows that the convergence is nonuniform on a chosen closed interval.

*Remark 3.* A strengthened versions of these statements are presented in Example 6.

**Example 6.** A sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges on a set *X*, but it does not converge uniformly on any subinterval of *X*.

#### Solution

To construct a counterexample, let us place all the rational numbers of the interval [0, 1] in a specific order of a numerical sequence  $r_n$ ,  $n = 1, 2, \cdots$  (this can be done, since the set of all the rational numbers of any interval is countable). Define now the functions  $f_n(x)$  on [0, 1] as follows:  $f_n(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x = r_1, r_2, \cdots, r_n \\ 0, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases}$ . This sequence is monotone in *n* for any fixed  $x \in [0, 1]$  (since  $f_n(r_{n+1}) = 0 < 1 = f_{n+1}(r_{n+1})$  and  $f_n(x) = f_{n+1}(x), \forall x \neq r_{n+1}$ ) and bounded (since  $0 \le f_n(x) \le 1, \forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \forall x \in [0, 1]$ ). Therefore, this sequence is convergent at any fixed  $x \in [0, 1]$  and  $f(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x \in \mathbb{Q} \\ 0, x \in \mathbb{I} \end{cases} = D(x)$ . The convergence is nonuniform on [0, 1] since for  $\forall n$  there exist  $x_n = r_{n+1}$  such that

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = |f_n(r_{n+1}) - f(r_{n+1})| = 1 \underset{n \to \infty}{\xrightarrow{\rightarrow}} 0.$$

Let us show that the convergence is also nonuniform on any interval  $[a, b] \subset [0, 1]$ , which will imply that the convergence is nonuniform on any interval in [0, 1]. In fact, since any interval contains infinitely many rational points, in [a, b] there are infinitely many points of the sequence  $r_1, r_2, r_3, \cdots$ , which form a subsequence  $r_{n_1}, r_{n_2}, r_{n_3}, \cdots, r_{n_k} \in [a, b]$ ,  $\forall k \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then for any  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exist  $n_k > k$  and  $x_k = r_{n_{k+1}} \in [a, b]$  such that

$$|f_{n_k}(x_k) - f(x_k)| = |f_{n_k}(r_{n_{k+1}}) - f(r_{n_{k+1}})| = 1 \underset{k \to \infty}{\not \to} 0,$$

which means that the convergence is nonuniform on [a, b].

*Remark 1.* The corresponding example for a series that converges on *X*, but does not converge uniformly on any subinterval of *X*, can be easily constructed using the sequence of the given counterexample as partial sums of the series. For instance, the series  $\sum u_n(x)$  with the terms  $u_n(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x = r_n \\ 0, x \neq r_n \end{cases}$  defined on [0, 1] has the partial sums  $f_n(x)$  of the above counterexample and, consequently, this series converges on [0, 1], but does not converge uniformly on any subinterval of [0, 1].

9

*Remark 2.* Another example of this type, albeit for a sequence of continuous on *X* functions  $f_n(x)$ , is given in Example 26 of Chapter 2.

**Example 7.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on an interval, but it does not converge absolutely on the same interval.

#### Solution

The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^2+n}{n^2}$  converges uniformly on the interval [-a, a],  $\forall a > 0$ . In fact, for any fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ , this is an alternating series, which converges by Leibniz's test:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{x^2+n}{n^2} = 0$  and  $\frac{x^2+n}{n^2}$  is strictly decreasing in *n* for any fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ . For alternating series, the remainder can be evaluated through its first term:  $|r_n(x)| \le |u_{n+1}(x)| = \frac{x^2+n+1}{(n+1)^2}$ . Therefore, for all  $x \in [-a, a]$ , we get

$$|r_n(x)| \le \frac{x^2 + n + 1}{(n+1)^2} \le \frac{a^2}{(n+1)^2} + \frac{1}{n+1} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0,$$

which implies the uniform convergence of the series on [-a, a]. However, the series of the absolute values  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} |u_n(x)| = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{2}+n}{n^2}$  diverges for any x: for x = 0, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  is harmonic and divergent; for  $\forall x \neq 0$ , the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{x^2}{n^2} + \frac{1}{n}\right)$  is the sum of the two series  $-\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{n^2}$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$ —where the former is convergent (*p*-series with p = 2) and the latter is divergent (the harmonic series), which implies the divergence of the sum. Hence, the given series is convergent on  $\mathbb{R}$ , uniformly convergent on [-a, a],  $\forall a > 0$ , but it does not possess absolute convergence at any point.

*Remark.* The converse situation is considered in Example 8.

**Example 8.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges absolutely on an interval, but it does not converge uniformly on the same interval.

#### Solution

The series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (-1)^n x^n$  converges absolutely on the interval X = [0, 1), because for  $\forall x \in [0, 1)$  the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} |u_n(x)| = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} x^n$  is the geometric series with the nonnegative ratio less than 1. However, the convergence is not uniform on [0, 1), because for  $\forall n$  we can choose  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n+1} \in [0, 1)$  that gives the following evaluation:

$$|r_n(x_n)| = \left|\frac{(-1)^{n+1}x_n^{n+1}}{1+x_n}\right| = \frac{\left(1-\frac{1}{n+1}\right)^{n+1}}{1+1-\frac{1}{n+1}} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} \frac{1}{2}e^{-1} \neq 0.$$



Figure 1.4 Example 7, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^2+n}{n^2}$ .

**Example 9.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges absolutely and uniformly on [a, b], but the series  $\sum |u_n(x)|$  does not converge uniformly on [a, b].

#### Solution

Let us consider the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (-1)^n (1-x)x^n$  on [0, 1]. If x = 1, then  $u_n(1) = 0$  and the series converges at this point. If  $x \neq 1$ , then for each fixed x we have the geometric series with the ratio q = -x, and since |q| = |x| < 1, the series is convergent. The series of the absolute values  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} |u_n(x)| = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (1-x)x^n$  is convergent on [0, 1] for the very same reasons.

Let us analyze the uniform convergence of the original series. Since this series is alternating, we have the following evaluation for its remainder  $r_n(x)$  for any n:

$$|r_n(x)| \le |u_{n+1}(x)| = (1-x)x^{n+1}, \forall x \in [0,1].$$

Note that the continuous function  $h(x) = (1 - x)x^{n+1}$  is positive on (0, 1) and at the end points h(0) = h(1) = 0. Therefore, h(x) achieves its global maximum in some interior point of [0, 1]. Solving the critical point equation

$$h'(x) = (n+1)x^n - (n+2)x^{n+1} = x^n[(n+1) - (n+2)x] = 0,$$

we find the only critical point  $x_n = \frac{n+1}{n+2}$  on (0, 1), which is the global maximum point of h(x) on [0, 1]. Thus, for  $\forall x \in [0, 1]$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} |r_n(x)| &\leq (1-x)x^{n+1} \leq (1-x_n)x_n^{n+1} \\ &= \frac{1}{n+2} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{n+2} \right)^{n+1} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} 0 \cdot e^{-1} = 0, \end{aligned}$$

that is, the convergences is uniform on [0, 1]. Finally, let us show that the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} |u_n(x)| = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (1-x)x^n$  does not converge uniformly on [0, 1]. It is sufficient to show that the convergence is nonuniform on [0, 1), so let us evaluate the remainder  $\tilde{r}_n(x)$  for  $x \in [0, 1)$ :

$$\tilde{r}_n(x) = \sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} |u_k(x)| = \frac{(1-x)x^{n+1}}{1-x} = x^{n+1}.$$

Choosing now the points  $x_n = \frac{1}{n+1/2} \in [0,1)$  for each *n*, we obtain  $\tilde{r}_n(x_n) =$  $\left(\frac{1}{n+\sqrt{2}}\right)^{n+1} = \frac{1}{2} \underset{n \to \infty}{\not\rightarrow} 0$ , which shows that the convergence is nonuniform on [0, 1) and, consequently, on [0, 1].

*Remark.* The converse general statement is true: if a series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} |u_n(x)|$  converges uniformly on [a, b], then the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x)$  converges absolutely and uniformly on [a, b].

**Example 10.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges absolutely and uniformly on X, but there is no bound of the general term  $u_n(x)$  on *X* in the form  $|u_n(x)| \le a_n, \forall n$ such that the series  $\sum a_n$  converges.

#### Solution

One of the counterexamples is the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)$  with the general term  $u_n(x) = \begin{cases} 0, x \in [0, 2^{-n-1}] \cup [2^{-n}, 1] \\ \frac{1}{2} \sin^2(2^{n+1}\pi x), x \in (2^{-n-1}, 2^{-n}) \end{cases}$  defined on X = [0, 1]. Note that  $u_n(x) \ge 0$  for  $\forall x \in [0, 1]$ , so the convergence and absolute convergence is the same thing for this series. At the points x = 0,  $x = 2^{-n}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and for  $\forall x \in \left[\frac{1}{2}, 1\right]$ , we get  $u_n(x) = 0$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the series converges to zero. If  $x \in (0, \frac{1}{2})$ ,  $x \neq 2^{-n}$ ,  $n \ge 2$ , then each of such points lies in only one of the intervals  $(2^{-n-1}, 2^{-n})$ , because these intervals have no common points:  $(2^{-n-1}, 2^{-n}) \cap (2^{-n-2}, 2^{-n-1}) = \emptyset, \forall n \in \mathbb{N}.$  Therefore, there is only one  $n_x$ such that  $x \in (2^{-n_x-1}, 2^{-n_x})$ . Then  $u_{n_x}(x) = \frac{1}{n_x} \sin^2(2^{n_x+1}\pi x)$  and  $u_n(x) = 0$ ,  $\forall n \neq n_x$  and, consequently,  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = u_{n_x}(x)$ , which shows the (absolute) convergence of this series on [0, 1].



**Figure 1.5** Examples 9 and 10 (second counterexample), series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (-1)^n (1-x) x^n$ .

Applying the Cauchy criterion and employing similar reasoning, we can also prove that the convergence is uniform. Indeed, since for any fixed  $x \in [0,1]$  at most only one term in the entire series is nonzero and this term satisfies the inequality  $|u_{n_x}(x)| = \left|\frac{1}{n_x}\sin^2(2^{n_x+1}\pi x)\right| \leq \frac{1}{n_x}$ , we obtain the following evaluation  $\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} u_k(x)\right| \leq \frac{1}{n+1} < \frac{1}{n}$ , which holds for  $\forall n, p \in \mathbb{N}$  and simultaneously for  $\forall x \in [0,1]$ . Hence, for  $\forall \varepsilon > 0$ , there exists  $N_{\varepsilon} = \left[\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right]$  such that for  $\forall n > N_{\varepsilon}, \forall p \in \mathbb{N}$  and simultaneously for all  $x \in [0,1]$ , it follows that  $\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p} u_k(x)\right| < \frac{1}{n} < \varepsilon$ , that is, the series converges uniformly on [0,1] according to the Cauchy criterion of the uniform convergence.

Nevertheless, the functions  $u_n(x)$  do not admit majoration on [0, 1] by the constants  $a_n$  such that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n$  converges. Indeed, for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , the inequality  $|u_n(x)| \leq \frac{1}{n}$  is exact (in the sense that  $\frac{1}{n}$  is the lowest upper bound for  $|u_n(x)|$ ) on [0, 1], because there exists the point  $x_n = 3 \cdot 2^{-n-2} \in (2^{-n-1}, 2^{-n})$  such that  $u_n(x_n) = \frac{1}{n} \sin^2 \left(\frac{3}{2}\pi\right) = \frac{1}{n}$ , and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  diverges.

Another interesting counterexample is the series of Example 9:  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (-1)^n (1-x)x^n$  on [0, 1]. It was shown in Example 9 that this series converges absolutely and uniformly on [0, 1]. For each fixed *n*, the function  $|u_n(x)| > 0$ ,  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ , and  $|u_n(0)| = |u_n(1)| = 0$ . Therefore, the continuous function  $|u_n(x)|$  achieves its global maximum in an interior point of [0, 1],



**Figure 1.6** Example 10, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x), u_n(x) = \begin{cases} 0, x \in [0, 2^{-n-1}] \cup [2^{-n}, 1] \\ \frac{1}{n} \sin^2(2^{n+1}\pi x), x \in (2^{-n-1}, 2^{-n}) \end{cases}$ 

which can be found by solving the critical point equation:

$$u_n(x)|' = (x^n - x^{n+1})' = nx^{n-1} - (n+1)x^n$$
$$= (n+1)x^{n-1}\left(\frac{n}{n+1} - x\right) = 0.$$

The unique solution on (0, 1) is  $x_n = \frac{n}{n+1}$  and, consequently,

$$|u_n(x)| \le \max_{[0,1]} |u_n(x)| = |u_n(x_n)| = \frac{1}{n+1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^n$$

Since  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^n = e^{-1}$  and the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n+1}$  diverges, according to the comparison test, the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n+1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^n$  also diverges. Note that for each *n*, the majorant term  $a_n = \frac{1}{n+1} \left(1 - \frac{1}{n+1}\right)^n$  is exact (i.e., the minimum possible) for  $|u_n(x)|$  on [0, 1]. Therefore, there is no convergent majorant series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n$  such that  $|u_n(x)| \le a_n$ .

*Remark*. The converse general statement is true and represents the famous Weierstrass M-test.

# **1.2 Uniform Convergence of Sequences and Series of Squares and Products**

**Example 11.** A sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to a function f(x), but  $f_n^2(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X* to  $f^2(x)$ .

### Solution

The sequence  $f_n(x) = \ln \frac{nx}{n+1}$  converges on  $X = (0, +\infty)$  to  $f(x) = \ln x$ , because  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} = \ln \left(\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{n}{n+1}\right) x = \ln x$ . The following evaluation shows that this convergence is uniform:

$$|f_n(x) - f(x)| = \left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} - \ln x \right| = \left| \ln \frac{n}{n+1} \right| < \varepsilon.$$

So for  $\forall \epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $N_{\epsilon} = \left[\frac{1}{e^{\epsilon}-1}\right]$ , which depends only on  $\epsilon$ , such that for  $\forall n > N_{\epsilon}$  and simultaneously for all  $x \in X$  we have  $|f_n(x) - f(x)| < \epsilon$ .

Due to arithmetic properties of the limits, the sequence  $f_n^2(x)$  also converges to  $f^2(x) = \ln^2 x$  for any fixed  $x \in X$  (it can also be shown directly:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \ln^2 \frac{nx}{n+1} = \left(\ln\left(\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{n}{n+1}\right)x\right)^2 = \ln^2 x$ ). However, this convergence is not uniform. In fact, for each  $x \in X$ , we get

$$|f_n^2(x) - f^2(x)| = \left| \ln^2 \frac{nx}{n+1} - \ln^2 x \right|$$
  
=  $\left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} - \ln x \right| \cdot \left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} + \ln x \right|$   
=  $\ln \frac{n+1}{n} \cdot \left| \ln \frac{nx^2}{n+1} \right|.$ 

Choosing now  $x_n = \frac{1}{ne^n} \in X$ , we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} |f_n^2(x_n) - f^2(x_n)| &= \ln \frac{n+1}{n} \cdot \left| \ln \frac{n}{(n+1)n^2 e^{2n}} \right| \\ &= \ln \frac{n+1}{n} \cdot \ln(n(n+1)e^{2n}) \\ &= \ln \frac{n+1}{n} \cdot \ln n(n+1) + 2n \ln \frac{n+1}{n} > 1 \end{aligned}$$

for sufficiently large *n* (since the first term is positive and the limit of the second equals two:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} 2n \ln \frac{n+1}{n} = \lim_{n \to \infty} 2\ln \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}\right)^n = 2\ln e = 2$ , that is,  $2n \ln \frac{n+1}{n} > 1$  for large *n*). Therefore, the convergence is not uniform: for  $\varepsilon_0 = 1$  whatever *N* is chosen, it can be found that  $\tilde{n} > N$  and corresponding  $x_{\tilde{n}} \in X$  such that  $|f_{\tilde{n}}^2(x_{\tilde{n}}) - f^2(x_{\tilde{n}})| > \varepsilon_0 = 1$ .

*Remark 1.* Naturally, the following example can also be constructed: sequences  $f_n(x)$  and  $g_n(x)$  converge uniformly on X to f(x) and g(x), respectively, but  $f_n(x)g_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on X to f(x)g(x). In the case  $f_n(x) = g_n(x)$ , we have the original example with the square of function. For different sequences, we can use the same  $f_n(x) = \ln \frac{nx}{n+1}$  and slightly different  $g_n(x) = \ln \frac{nx}{2n+5}$ . The sequence  $g_n(x)$  converges to  $g(x) = \ln \frac{x}{2}$ , and this convergence is uniform on  $X = (0, +\infty)$  due to the evaluation

$$\begin{aligned} |g_n(x) - g(x)| &= \left| \ln \frac{nx}{2n+5} - \ln \frac{x}{2} \right| \\ &= \left| \ln \frac{2n}{2n+5} \right| = \ln \left( 1 + \frac{5}{2n} \right) \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0. \end{aligned}$$

Consequently,  $f_n(x)g_n(x)$  converges to  $f(x)g(x) = \ln x \ln \frac{x}{2}$  for each fixed  $x \in X$  due to arithmetic rules of the limits. However, this convergence is not uniform on *X*, as it is shown below: for each  $x \in X$ , we have

$$\begin{split} |f_n(x)g_n(x) - f(x)g(x)| &= \left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} \ln \frac{nx}{2n+5} - \ln x \ln \frac{x}{2} \right| \\ &= \left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} \ln \frac{nx}{2n+5} - \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} \ln \frac{x}{2} \right| \\ &+ \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} \ln \frac{x}{2} - \ln x \ln \frac{x}{2} \right| \\ &= \left| \ln \frac{nx}{n+1} \ln \frac{2n}{2n+5} + \ln \frac{x}{2} \ln \frac{n}{n+1} \right|, \end{split}$$

and for the special choice of the points  $x_n = \frac{1}{ne^n} \in X$ , we obtain

$$\begin{split} |f_n(x_n)g_n(x_n) - f(x_n)g(x_n)| &= \left| \ln \frac{1}{(n+1)e^n} \ln \frac{2n}{2n+5} + \ln \frac{1}{2ne^n} \ln \frac{n}{n+1} \right| \\ &= \left| (n+\ln(n+1)) \ln \left( 1 + \frac{5}{2n} \right) + (n+\ln 2n) \ln \left( 1 + \frac{1}{n} \right) \right| \\ &= \frac{5}{2} \cdot \frac{2n}{5} \ln \left( 1 + \frac{5}{2n} \right) + \frac{\ln(n+1)}{2n/5} \frac{2n}{5} \ln \left( 1 + \frac{5}{2n} \right) \\ &+ n \ln \left( 1 + \frac{1}{n} \right) + \frac{\ln 2n}{n} n \ln \left( 1 + \frac{1}{n} \right) \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} \frac{5}{2} \cdot 1 \\ &+ 0 \cdot 1 + 1 + 0 \cdot 1 = \frac{7}{2}. \end{split}$$

In the evaluation of the last limit, we have used the following auxiliary limits:

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{n}{\alpha} \ln\left(1 + \frac{\alpha}{n}\right) = \lim_{n \to \infty} \ln\left(1 + \frac{\alpha}{n}\right)^{n/\alpha} = \ln e = 1, \quad \forall \alpha \neq 0$$



**Figure 1.7** Examples 11 and 17, sequence  $f_n(x) = \ln \frac{nx}{n+1}$ .



**Figure 1.8** Example 11, sequence of squares  $f_n^2(x) = \ln^2 \frac{nx}{n+1}$ .

according to the second remarkable limit, and

$$\lim_{t \to \infty} \frac{\ln(\alpha t + \beta)}{t} = \lim_{t \to \infty} \frac{\alpha/(\alpha t + \beta)}{1} = 0, \quad \forall \alpha > 0, \forall \beta$$

due to l'Hospital's rule. Therefore, for  $\varepsilon_0=1$  whatever N is chosen, there is  $\tilde{n} > N$  and corresponding  $x_{\tilde{n}} \in X$  such that  $|f_{\tilde{n}}(x_{\tilde{n}})g_{\tilde{n}}(x_{\tilde{n}}) - f(x_{\tilde{n}})g(x_{\tilde{n}})| > \varepsilon_0 = 1$ , that is, the convergence is nonuniform.

*Remark 2.* The following general statement is true for the sum and difference: if  $f_n(x)$  and  $g_n(x)$  converge uniformly on X to f(x) and g(x), respectively, then  $f_n(x) \pm g_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to  $f(x) \pm g(x)$ .

*Remark 3.* The following general statement is true for the product: if  $f_n(x)$ and  $g_n(x)$  converge uniformly on X to f(x) and g(x), respectively, and f(x)and g(x) are bounded on X, then  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x)$  converges uniformly on X to  $f(x) \cdot g(x)$ . (Note the requirement of boundedness of the limit functions in this formulation.)

**Example 12.** Sequences  $f_n(x)$  and  $g_n(x)$  converge nonuniformly on X to f(x)and g(x), respectively, but  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x)$  converges to  $f(x) \cdot g(x)$  uniformly on X.

#### Solution

Consider the sequences  $f_n(x) = \frac{1}{n\sqrt{x}}$  and  $g_n(x) = nxe^{-nx}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ . Both sequences converge to 0 for any fixed  $x \in X$ :

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1}{n\sqrt{x}} = 0 = f(x);$$
$$\lim_{n \to \infty} g_n(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} nxe^{-nx} = \lim_{t \to +\infty} \frac{t}{e^t} = \lim_{t \to +\infty} \frac{1}{e^t} = 0 = g(x).$$

Therefore,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x) = 0$ . Let us investigate the nature of the convergence of these sequences. For  $f_n(x)$ , choosing  $x_n = \frac{1}{n^2} \in X$ , we obtain

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = \frac{1}{n\sqrt{x_n}} = \frac{n}{n} = 1 \underset{n \to \infty}{\xrightarrow{}} 0,$$

that is, this convergence is nonuniform on X. Similarly, choosing  $x_n = \frac{1}{n} \in X$ , we can show the nonuniform convergence of  $g_n(x)$  on *X*:

$$|g_n(x_n) - g(x_n)| = nx_n e^{-nx_n} = 1 \cdot e^{-1} \underset{n \to \infty}{\xrightarrow{\to}} 0.$$

Finally, for  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x)$ , we have  $|f_n(x)g_n(x) - f(x)g(x)| = \sqrt{x}e^{-nx}$ . The derivative of the right-hand side is

$$(\sqrt{x}e^{-nx})_x = \left(\frac{1}{2\sqrt{x}} - n\sqrt{x}\right)e^{-nx} = \frac{n}{\sqrt{x}}e^{-nx}\left(\frac{1}{2n} - x\right).$$

Therefore, the point  $x_n = \frac{1}{2n} \in X$  is the only local (and global) maximum of  $\sqrt{x}e^{-nx}$  on X. Consequently,

$$|f_n(x)g_n(x) - f(x)g(x)| \le \max_{(0,+\infty)} \sqrt{x}e^{-nx} = \sqrt{x_n}e^{-nx_n} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2n}}e^{-1/2} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} 0,$$

that is,  $f_{\mu}(x) \cdot g_{\mu}(x)$  converges uniformly on X to 0.

**Example 13.** A sequence  $f_n^2(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but  $f_n(x)$  diverges on X.

#### Solution

Consider the sequence  $f_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{n+1}{n} x$  on X = (0, 1]. The sequence of squares  $f_n^2(x) = \frac{(n+1)^2}{n^2} x^2$  converges uniformly on (0, 1] to  $x^2$ , because

$$|f_n^2(x) - x^2| = \left| \frac{(n+1)^2}{n^2} x^2 - x^2 \right| = x^2 \frac{2n+1}{n^2} \le \frac{2}{n} + \frac{1}{n^2} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0.$$

However, there is no limit of  $f_n(x)$  for any fixed  $x \in (0, 1]$ , since two partial limits give different results:  $f_{2n}(x) = \frac{2n+1}{2n} x \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} x$  and  $f_{2n+1}(x) = -\frac{2n+2}{2n+1} x \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} -x$ .

Remark 1. The same sequence can be used to exemplify the following situation: a sequence  $|f_n(x)|$  converges uniformly on X, but  $f_n(x)$  diverges on X. Indeed, although  $f_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{n+1}{n} x$  does not converge on X = (0, 1], the sequence  $|f_n(x)| = \frac{n+1}{n}x$  converges uniformly to x on  $X = \{0, 1\}$ :

$$||f_n(x)| - x| = \left|\frac{n+1}{n}x - x\right| = \frac{1}{n}|x| \le \frac{1}{n} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{\to} 0.$$

*Remark 2.* Note that the inequality  $||f_n(x)| - |f(x)|| \le |f_n(x) - f(x)|$  ensures the validity of the converse general statement: if  $f_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to f(x), then  $|f_n(x)|$  converges uniformly on *X* to |f(x)|.

*Remark 3.* The following example also takes place: a sequence  $f_n^2(x)$  converges uniformly on X and  $f_n(x)$  converges on X, but the convergence of  $f_n(x)$  is nonuniform. Consider the sequence  $f_n(x)$  on [0, 1] similar to that analyzed in Example 6:  $f_n(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x = r_1, r_2, \cdots, r_n \\ -1, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases}$ , where  $r_n$  is the sequence

of all the rational points in [0,1] ordered in some way. This sequence is monotone in *n* for any fixed  $x \in [0,1]$  (since  $f_n(r_{n+1}) = -1 < 1 = f_{n+1}(r_{n+1})$ and  $f_n(x) = f_{n+1}(x)$ ,  $\forall x \neq r_{n+1}$ ) and bounded (since  $-1 \leq f_n(x) \leq 1$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\forall x \in [0,1]$ ). Therefore, this sequence is convergent at any fixed  $x \in [0,1]$ and  $f(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = \begin{cases} 1, x \in \mathbb{Q} \\ -1, x \in \mathbb{I} \end{cases}$ . The sequence of the squares consists of the same constant function  $f_n^2(x) = 1$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and, therefore, it converges uniformly on [0, 1] to  $f^2(x) = 1$ . At the same time, using the same reasoning as in Example 6, one can show that the convergence of  $f_n(x)$  is nonuniform on [0, 1] and on any subinterval of [0, 1].

**Example 14.** A sequence  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to 0, but neither  $f_n(x)$  nor  $g_n(x)$  converges to 0 on *X*.

#### Solution

The sequences  $f_n(x) = nx + (-1)^n nx$  and  $g_n(x) = nx - (-1)^n nx$  are divergent for every fixed  $x \in X = (0, +\infty)$ :

$$f_{2n}(x) = 4nx \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} +\infty, f_{2n+1}(x) = 0 \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0;$$
  
$$g_{2n}(x) = 0 \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} 0, g_{2n+1}(x) = (4n+2)x \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} +\infty.$$

However,  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x) = n^2 x^2 - n^2 x^2 = 0$  converges uniformly to 0 on *X*.

Another interesting counterexample includes the sequences  $f_n(x) =$  $\begin{cases} \frac{nx}{n+1}, x \in \mathbb{Q} \cap X \\ \frac{x}{n}, x \in \mathbb{I} \cap X \end{cases} \text{ and } g_n(x) = \begin{cases} \frac{x}{n}, x \in \mathbb{Q} \cap X \\ \frac{nx}{n+1}, x \in \mathbb{I} \cap X \end{cases} \text{ defined on } X = (0, 1]. \\ \text{Both sequences converge on } X \text{ to nonzero functions } f(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) = \\ \begin{cases} x, x \in \mathbb{Q} \cap X \\ 0, x \in \mathbb{I} \cap X \end{cases} \text{ and } g(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} g_n(x) = \begin{cases} 0, x \in \mathbb{Q} \cap X \\ x, x \in \mathbb{I} \cap X \end{cases}, \text{ respectively. At the } x \in \mathbb{I} \cap X \end{cases}$ same time,  $\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x)g_n(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{x^2}{n+1} = 0$ , for  $\forall x \in (0, 1]$  and this convergence is uniform on *X*, since the estimate

$$|f_n(x)g_n(x) - 0| = \frac{x^2}{n+1} \le \frac{1}{n+1} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} 0$$

holds simultaneously for all  $x \in (0, 1]$ .

**Example 15.** A sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to a function f(x),  $f_n(x) \neq 0, f(x) \neq 0, \forall x \in X$ , but  $\frac{1}{f_n(x)}$  does not converge uniformly on *X* to  $\frac{1}{f(x)}$ .

#### Solution

The sequence  $f_n(x) = \frac{nx}{n+2}$  converges uniformly on X = (0, 1) to f(x) = x:

$$|f_n(x) - f(x)| = \left|\frac{nx}{n+2} - x\right| = \frac{2}{n+2}|x| < \frac{2}{n+2} < \epsilon$$

and the last inequality holds for  $\forall \epsilon > 0$  and simultaneously for all  $x \in X$  if we choose  $\forall n > N_{\epsilon} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{2}{\epsilon} \end{bmatrix}$ . On the other hand,

$$\left|\frac{1}{f_n(x)} - \frac{1}{f(x)}\right| = \left|\frac{n+2}{nx} - \frac{1}{x}\right| = \frac{2}{n}\frac{1}{|x|},$$

and for  $x_n = \frac{1}{n} \in X$ , it follows that  $\left|\frac{1}{f_n(x_n)} - \frac{1}{f(x_n)}\right| = n\frac{2}{n} = 2$ , which means that the convergence is nonuniform.

**Example 16.** A sequence  $f_n(x)$  is bounded uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  and converges uniformly on [-a, a],  $\forall a > 0$ , to a function f(x), but the numerical sequence  $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} f_n(x)$  does not converge to  $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} f(x)$ .

#### Solution

Consider the sequence  $f_n(x) = e^{-(x-n)^2}$ , which is defined and uniformly bounded on  $\mathbb{R}$ :  $0 < e^{-(x-n)^2} \le 1$ ,  $\forall n, \forall x \in \mathbb{R}$ . This sequence converges to zero on  $\mathbb{R}$ , since for any fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  one has  $(x-n)^2 \to +\infty$  and, consequently,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} e^{-(x-n)^2} = \lim_{t\to+\infty} e^{-t} = 0$ . Hence,  $f(x) \equiv 0$  on  $\mathbb{R}$  and, consequently,  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f(x) = 0$ . On the other hand,  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f_n(x) = 1$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , since  $f_n(x) \le 1$  and  $f_n(n) = 1$ . This means that  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f_n(x) = 1$  does not converge to  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f(x) = 0$ . It just remains to prove the uniform convergence of  $f_n(x)$  on [-a, a],  $\forall a > 0$ . For any fixed a > 0, there exists the natural number  $N_a > a$ . Then for  $\forall n > N_a$ , one gets  $(x - n)^2 \ge (a - n)^2$  for each  $x \in [-a, a]$ . Therefore,

 $|f_n(x) - f(x)| = e^{-(x-n)^2} \le e^{-(a-n)^2}$ 

for all  $x \in [-a, a]$ . Since exp  $(-(a - n)^2) \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{n \to \infty} 0$ , the last inequality guarantees the uniformity of the convergence on [-a, a], where a > 0 is arbitrary. Note, however, that the convergence of  $f_n(x)$  is not uniform on  $\mathbb{R}$ , which is evident if one chooses  $x_n = n$  leading to

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = e^{-(n-n)^2} = 1.$$

*Remark* 1. Two other interesting counterexamples are  $f_n(x) = \arctan \frac{x}{n}$  and  $f_n(x) = \frac{2nx}{n^2+x^2}$ . For instance, for the first function the reasoning can be as follows. First, note that the sequence is uniformly bounded on  $\mathbb{R}$  ( $\left|\arctan \frac{x}{n}\right| < \frac{\pi}{2}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}$ ). Second, it converges to zero for any fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  ( $\lim_{n \to \infty} \arctan \frac{x}{n} = 0$ ). Further, this convergence is uniform on [-a, a],  $\forall a > 0$  due to the evaluation

$$|f_n(x) - f(x)| = \left| \arctan \frac{x}{n} \right| = \arctan \frac{|x|}{n} \le \arctan \frac{a}{n},$$

that holds for all  $x \in [-a, a]$  (here we used the properties that  $\arctan t$  is an odd and a strictly increasing function). Since  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \arctan \frac{a}{n} = 0$ , the last evaluation implies the uniform convergence. Hence, all the conditions of the example are satisfied, but still the sequence  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f_n(x)$  does not converge to  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f(x)$ , because  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} \arctan \frac{x}{n} = \frac{\pi}{2}$  for any n, while  $\sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} f(x) = \sup_{x\in\mathbb{R}} 0 = 0$ . Note, that just like in the first counterexample, the convergence of  $f_n(x)$  is not uniform on  $\mathbb{R}$ : for any none can choose  $x_n = n$  to obtain

$$|f_n(x_n) - f(x_n)| = \arctan \frac{n}{n} = \arctan 1 = \frac{\pi}{4} \neq 0.$$

*Remark 2.* The following general statement is true: if a sequence  $f_n(x)$  is bounded uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  and converges uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  to a function f(x), then the numerical sequence  $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} f_n(x)$  converges to  $\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} f(x)$ . (Note the requirement of uniform convergence on  $\mathbb{R}$  to the limit function in this formulation.)

*Remark 3.* The condition of uniform convergence of a sequence  $f_n(x)$  to a function f(x) on X is equivalent to the condition  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \sup_{x\in X} |f_n(x) - f(x)| = 0.$ 

**Example 17.** Suppose each function  $f_n(x)$  maps *X* on *Y* and function g(y) is continuous on *Y*; the sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but the sequence  $g_n(x) = g(f_n(x))$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Let us consider the sequence  $f_n(x) = \ln \frac{nx}{n+1}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$  and function  $g(y) = e^y$ . Each of the functions  $f_n(x)$  maps  $(0, +\infty)$  on the entire real line and the function g(y) is continuous on  $\mathbb{R}$ . In Example 11, it was shown that the sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges uniformly on X to the function  $f(x) = \ln x$ . The corresponding sequence  $g_n(x) = g(f_n(x)) = \frac{nx}{n+1}$  converges for any fixed  $x \in (0, +\infty)$ :

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} g_n(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{nx}{n+1} = x = g(f(x)),$$

but this convergence is not uniform. In fact,

$$|g_n(x) - g(f(x))| = \left|\frac{nx}{n+1} - x\right| = \frac{1}{n+1}x$$

and choosing  $x_n = (n + 1) \in X$ , one gets

$$|g_n(x_n) - g(f(x_n))| = \frac{x_n}{n+1} = 1.$$



Figure 1.9 Example 16, sequence  $f_n(x) = e^{-(x-n)^2}$ .

*Remark.* The following example also takes place: suppose functions  $f_n(x)$  map X on Y and function g(y) is continuous on Y; the sequence  $f_n(x)$  converges nonuniformly on X, but the sequence  $g_n(x) = g(f_n(x))$  converges uniformly on X. In the trivial case, one can use an arbitrary nonuniformly convergent sequence  $f_n(x)$  and the constant function  $g(y) \equiv 1$ . For a nonconstant function g(y), one can use the above sequence  $f_n(x) = \frac{nx}{n+1}$  defined on  $X = (0, +\infty)$  and the function  $g(y) = \ln y$ .

**Example 18.** A series  $\sum u_n^2(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

In Remark 1 to Example 5, it was shown that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$ . However, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n^2}$  converges uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  according to the Weierstrass test:  $\frac{\sin^2 nx}{n^2} \leq \frac{1}{n^2}$ ,  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}$  and the majorant series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^2}$  converges.

**Example 19.** A series  $\sum u_n^2(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)$  does not converge (even pointwise) on *X*.



**Figure 1.10** Examples 19, 20, and 21, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n+n}$ .

#### Solution

Consider the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{x+n}$  on  $X = [0, +\infty)$ . This series is divergent at each point  $x \in X$ , since  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1/n}{1/(x+n)} = 1$  and the harmonic series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  is divergent. At the same time, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(x+n)^2}$  converges uniformly on  $X = [0, +\infty)$ due to the Weierstrass test:  $\frac{1}{(x+n)^2} \le \frac{1}{n^2}$ ,  $\forall x \in X$  and the majorant series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^2}$ converges.

*Remark.* If  $\sum u_n(x)$  diverges, it may happen that  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(x)$  also diverges. For instance, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n}}$  diverges at each point  $x \in X = [0, 1]$  according to the comparison test:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1/\sqrt{n}}{1/(\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n})} = 1$  and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$  is divergent. Due to the very same arguments, the series of squares also diverges on X = [0, 1]:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1/n}{1/(\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n})^2} = 1$  and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  is divergent.

**Example 20.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but at least one of the series  $\sum u_n(x)$  or  $\sum v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on X.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{x+n}$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{1}{x^2+n^2}$  on  $X = [0, +\infty)$ . The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on X due to the Weierstrass test:



**Figure 1.11** Example 19, series of squares  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(x+n)^2}$ .

$$|u_n(x)v_n(x)| = \frac{1}{x+n}\frac{1}{x^2+n^2} \le \frac{1}{n^3}, \quad \forall x \in [0, +\infty)$$

and  $\sum \frac{1}{n^3}$  is a convergent series. The same reasoning shows the uniform convergence of the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \nu_n(x)$  on *X*:

$$|v_n(x)| = \frac{1}{x^2 + n^2} \le \frac{1}{n^2}, \quad \forall x \in [0, +\infty)$$

and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^2}$  is a convergent series. However, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)$  diverges on *X*, since  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \frac{1/n}{1/(x+n)} = 1$  and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n}$  is divergent.

**Example 21.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but neither  $\sum u_n(x)$  nor  $\sum v_n(x)$  converges (even pointwise) on *X*.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{x+n}$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n}}$  on  $X = [0, +\infty)$ . The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on X due to the Weierstrass test:

$$|u_n(x)v_n(x)| = \frac{1}{x+n} \frac{1}{\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n}} \le \frac{1}{n^{3/2}}, \quad \forall x \in [0, +\infty)$$

and  $\sum \frac{1}{n^{3/2}}$  is a convergent series. However, both  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} v_n(x)$  diverge on *X* according to the comparison test:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1/n}{1/(x+n)} = 1$  and the series  $\sum \frac{1}{n}$  diverges;  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1/\sqrt{n}}{1/(\sqrt{x}+\sqrt{n})} = 1$  and the series  $\sum \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$  diverges.

**Example 22.** Series  $\sum u_n(x)$  and  $\sum v_n(x)$  converge nonuniformly on *X*, but  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  (see Remark 1 to Example 5), and so does the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}$  (applying for the latter series the same reasoning as for the former in Remark 1 to Example 5). However, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n^{3/2}}$  converges uniformly on  $\mathbb{R}$  according to the Weierstrass test:  $\frac{\sin^2 nx}{n^{3/2}} \leq \frac{1}{n^{3/2}}, \forall x \in \mathbb{R}$  and the majorant series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^{3/2}}$  converges.

**Example 23.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but  $\sum u_n^2(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

The uniform convergence of the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt[3]{n}}$  on X = (0, 1) can be proved by applying Abel's theorem. In fact, the series  $\sum (-1)^n \frac{1}{\sqrt[3]{n}}$  converges by Leibniz's test of alternating series (and this convergence is uniform on X, since the series does not depend on x), and the sequence  $x^n$  is monotone in n for each  $x \in (0, 1)$  and is uniformly bounded, since  $x^n < 1$ ,  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

On the other hand, the convergence of the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{2n}}{n^{2/3}}$  is nonuniform on X = (0, 1). In fact, this series converges on X = (0, 1), since  $u_n^2(x) = \frac{x^{2n}}{n^{2/3}} \le x^{2n}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and the series  $\sum x^{2n}$  is convergent by being a geometric series with the ratio in (0, 1). At the same time, applying the Cauchy criterion of the uniform convergence with  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \left(1 - \frac{1}{4n}\right) \in X$ , one obtains

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k^2(x_n)\right| = \sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} \frac{x_n^{2k}}{k^{2/3}} > n \frac{x_n^{4n}}{(2n)^{2/3}} = \frac{n^{1/3}}{4^{1/3}} \left(1 - \frac{1}{4n}\right)^{4n} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} +\infty,$$

that is, the series  $\sum u_n^2(x)$  converges nonuniformly on X = (0, 1).

*Remark 1.* If, in the given counterexample, one changes the set *X* to (0, 1], then  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt[3]{n}}$  converges uniformly on *X* = (0, 1] (due to the



**Figure 1.12** Examples 22, 5, and 18, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{n}$ .



**Figure 1.13** Examples 22 and 24, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}$ .





**Figure 1.14** Example 22, series of products  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n^{3/2}}$ .

same reasoning as before), but  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{2n}}{n^{2/3}}$  diverges at x = 1 since  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(1) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^{2/3}}$  is a divergent *p*-series.

*Remark 2.* Evidently, the following more general example can also be constructed: both series  $\sum u_n(x)$  and  $\sum v_n(x)$  converge uniformly on X, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on X. In the particular case  $u_n(x) = v_n(x)$ , the counterexample is already provided above. Let us consider the case when  $u_n(x) \neq v_n(x)$ . For instance, using the same arguments as before, one can prove that both  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  converge uniformly on X = (0, 1), but the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{2n}}{n^{5/6}}$  converges nonuniformly on X = (0, 1). For the last series, its convergence follows from the evaluation  $\frac{x^{2n}}{n^{5/6}} \leq x^{2n}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the convergence of the geometric series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^{2n}$  for  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ , while the nonuniformity can be shown by the Cauchy criterion, choosing as above  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \left(1 - \frac{1}{4n}\right) \in X$ :

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k(x_n) v_k(x_n)\right| = \sum_{k=n+1}^{2^n} \frac{x_n^{2k}}{k^{5/6}} > n \frac{x_n^{4n}}{(2n)^{5/6}} = \frac{n^{1/6}}{2^{5/6}} \left(1 - \frac{1}{4n}\right)^{4n} \underset{n \to +\infty}{\to} \infty.$$



**Figure 1.15** Example 23, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt[3]{n}}$ .



**Figure 1.16** Example 23, series of squares  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{2n}}{n^{2/3}}$ .

**Example 24.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, but  $\sum u_n^2(x)$  does not converge (even pointwise) on X.

#### Solution

The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}$  is uniformly convergent on  $X = [a, \pi - a]$ ,  $\forall a \in \left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right)$ , which can be shown using the same considerations as for  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{n}$  in Remark 1 to Example 5. Let us prove that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n}$  is divergent on *X*. Note that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\cos 2nx}{n}$  is uniformly convergent on *X* just like the series in Remark 1 to Example 5. The series of squares can be rewritten in the form  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n^2(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1-\cos 2nx}{2n}$ , that is, the general term  $u_n^2(x)$  is the difference of the general term of the divergent harmonic series and uniformly convergent series. This implies the divergence of the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n}$  at each point of X.

Remark. Naturally, the following more general situation also takes place: both series  $\sum u_n(x)$  and  $\sum v_n(x)$  converge uniformly on *X*, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$ does not converge (even pointwise) on *X*. In the particular case  $u_n(x) = v_n(x)$ , the counterexample is given above. Let us consider the case when  $u_n(x) \neq v_n(x)$ . For instance, using the same arguments as before, one can prove that both  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\cos nx}{\sqrt[3]{n}} \text{ and } \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\cos nx}{\sqrt[4]{n}} \text{ converge uniformly on } X = [a, \pi - a], \forall a \in \left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right),$ but the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\cos^2 nx}{n^{7/12}}$  diverges at each point of *X*, because its general term can be represented in the form  $\frac{\cos^2 nx}{n^{7/12}} = \frac{1}{2n^{7/12}} + \frac{\cos 2nx}{2n^{7/12}}$ , where the first summand is a general term of the divergent *p*-series, while the second is a general term of the uniformly convergent series.

**Example 25.** Both series  $\sum u_n(x)$  and  $\sum v_n(x)$  are nonnegative for  $\forall x \in X$ ,  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{u_n(x)}{v_n(x)} = 1$  and one of these series converges uniformly on *X*, but another series does not converge uniformly on X.

#### Solution

Consider the two nonnegative series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{n^4 + x^4}$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{n^4 + x^2}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ . The limit of the general terms equals 1:  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{u_n(x)}{v_n(x)} = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{n^4 + x^2}{n^4 + x^4} = 1$  for  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}$ . Also, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{n^4 + x^4}$  converges uniformly on  $X = \mathbb{R}$  by the Weierstrass test, since  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{2n^2} \frac{2n^2 x^2}{n^4 + x^4} \le \frac{1}{2n^2}$ ,  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}$  and the series  $\sum \frac{1}{2n^2}$  converges. Therefore, all the statement conditions hold. At the same time, the second series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{n^4 + x^2}$  converges on  $X = \mathbb{R}$  since  $\frac{x^2}{n^4 + x^2} \le \frac{x^2}{n^4}$ ,  $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}$  and the series  $\sum_{x^4} \frac{1}{x^4}$  converges. However, the convergence of the second



**Figure 1.17** Example 24, series of squares  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin^2 nx}{n}$ .

series is nonuniform since its general term does not converge to 0 uniformly: for  $x_n = n^2$ , one gets  $v_n(x_n) = \frac{x_n^2}{n^4 + x_n^2} = \frac{1}{2} \underset{n \to \infty}{\Rightarrow} 0.$ 

*Remark.* For numerical series and for the pointwise convergence of series of functions, the corresponding general statement is true and represents a particular case of the Comparison test for nonnegative series: if both series  $\sum u_n(x)$  and  $\sum v_n(x)$  are nonnegative for  $\forall x \in X$ ,  $\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{u_n(x)}{v_n(x)} = const > 0$  and one of these series converges on *X*, then another series also converges on *X*.

# 1.3 Dirichlet's and Abel's Theorems

*Remark to Examples* 26–29. In the following four examples, the conditions of Dirichlet's theorem, which provides sufficient conditions for the uniform convergence of the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$ , are analyzed. It is shown that none of the three conditions stated in the theorem can be dropped. At the same time, these conditions are not necessary: all of them can be violated for an uniformly convergent series.

**Example 26.** The partial sums of  $\sum u_n(x)$  are bounded for  $\forall x \in X$ , and the sequence  $v_n(x)$  is monotone in *n* for each fixed  $x \in X$  and converges uniformly on *X* to 0, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Let  $u_n(x) = x^n$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{1}{n}$  be defined on X = (0, 1). The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^n$  converges on X, since this is a geometric series with the ratio in (0, 1). Therefore, the partial sums of this series are bounded for each fixed  $x \in X$ . However, the boundedness is not uniform as is seen from the evaluation of the partial sums at the points  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n}$ , n > 1 lying in X:

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n} x_n^k = \frac{x_n}{1 - x_n} (1 - x_n^n) = \frac{1 - 1/n}{1/n} \left( 1 - \left( 1 - \frac{1}{n} \right)^n \right)$$
$$= (n - 1) \left( 1 - \left( 1 - \frac{1}{n} \right)^n \right) \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} +\infty,$$

that is, the first condition in Dirichlet's theorem is weakened. The remaining two conditions hold:  $v_n(x) = \frac{1}{n}$  is monotone and  $v_n(x) = \frac{1}{n} \xrightarrow{n \to \infty} 0$  (and the last convergence is uniform, because  $v_n$  does not depend on x).

convergence is uniform, because  $v_n$  does not depend on x). The series of the products  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges on (0, 1), since  $0 < \frac{x^n}{n} \le x^n$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and the geometric series converges for  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ . However, this convergence is nonuniform, which can be shown by the Cauchy criterion: choosing  $p_n = n$  and  $\tilde{x}_n = 1 - \frac{1}{2n} \in X$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ , one obtains:

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k(\tilde{x}_n) v_k(\tilde{x}_n)\right| = \sum_{k=n+1}^{2n} \frac{\tilde{x}_n^k}{k} > n \frac{\tilde{x}_n^{2n}}{2n} = \frac{1}{2} \left(1 - \frac{1}{2n}\right)^{2n} \underset{n \to +\infty}{\to} \frac{1}{2} e^{-1} \neq 0.$$

**Example 27.** The partial sums of  $\sum u_n(x)$  are uniformly bounded on *X*, and the sequence  $v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X* to 0, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Let  $u_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  and  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  be defined on X = (0, 1). The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  converges by Leibniz's test and, consequently, its partial sums are bounded (and this boundedness is uniform on X, because the general term does not depend on x). The sequence  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  converges uniformly on X to 0 due to the following evaluation:  $\left| (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}} \right| \le \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$ ,  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$  and  $\frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \xrightarrow{\to} 0$ . Thus, both conditions of the statement hold, but the series of the products  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on (0, 1) as was shown in Example 26. Note that the sequence  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$ 

is not monotone in *n*, that is, the condition of the monotonicity of  $v_n(x)$  in Dirihlet's theorem is violated.

**Example 28.** The partial sums of  $\sum u_n(x)$  are uniformly bounded on *X*, and the sequence  $v_n(x)$  is monotone in *n* for each fixed  $x \in X$  and converges on *X* to 0, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = (-1)^n$  and  $v_n(x) = x^n$  on X = (0, 1). The partial sums  $\sum_{k=1}^n u_k(x)$  are uniformly bounded on X:  $\left|\sum_{k=1}^n u_k(x)\right| = \left|\sum_{k=1}^n (-1)^k\right| \le 1$ , for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ . The sequence  $v_n(x) = x^n$  is decreasing in n and  $v_n(x) = x^n \to 0$  for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ . Thus, the conditions of the statement are satisfied. However, the series of the products converges nonuniformly. In fact,  $\sum_{n=1}^\infty u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^\infty (-1)^n x^n$  is a convergent geometric series on (0, 1) (the ratio  $-x \in (-1, 0)$ ), but the evaluation of its residual shows that this convergence is nonuniform: choosing  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n+1} \in (0, 1)$ , one obtains



**Figure 1.18** Examples 26, 29, and 33, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^n$ .

Note that the third condition of Dirichlet's theorem (the uniform convergence of  $v_n(x)$ ) is weakened in the above statement, and the chosen sequence  $v_n(x) = x^n$  converges nonuniformly to 0 on X = (0, 1), since for  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n} \in (0, 1)$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  it follows  $|v_n(x_n)| = \left(1 - \frac{1}{n}\right)^n \xrightarrow[n \to +\infty]{} e^{-1} \neq 0$ .

**Example 29.** The partial sums of  $\sum u_n(x)$  are not uniformly bounded on *X*, and the sequence  $v_n(x)$  is not monotone in *n* and does not converge uniformly on *X* to 0, but still the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = x^n$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{xn^2}$  on X = (0, 1). Let us check the conditions of the statement. First, the partial sums of  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^n$  are not uniformly bounded on X (see for details Example 26). Second, the sequence  $v_n(x)$  is not monotone in n (it is alternating for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ ). Finally,  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{xn^2}$  converges to 0 for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ , but this convergence is not uniform, because choosing  $x_n = \frac{1}{n^2}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  one obtains  $\left|\frac{(-1)^n}{x_nn^2}\right| = 1 \xrightarrow[n \to +\infty]{n \to +\infty} 0$ . In this way, all the conditions in Dirichlet's theorem are violated. Nevertheless, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}$  converges uniformly on (0, 1)



**Figure 1.19** Examples 26, 27, 30, 31, and 32, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$ .

according to the Weierstrass test:  $\left|(-1)^n \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}\right| \leq \frac{1}{n^2}$ , for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ , and the majorant series  $\sum \frac{1}{n^2}$  converges.

*Remark.* The functions  $u_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$  and  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n x$  considered on X = (0, 10] exhibit even "wilder" behavior. In fact, the partial sums of the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x}{n}$  are not bounded at any point  $x \in (0, 10]$  since this series is positive and divergent at each  $x \in (0, 10]$ . The sequence  $(-1)^n x$  is not monotone in n and diverges at each  $x \in (0, 10]$ . Nevertheless, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^2}{n}$  converges uniformly on (0, 10] since the following evaluation of the residual (resulting from Leibniz's test for alternating series)

$$|r_n(x)| = \left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} (-1)^k \frac{x^2}{k}\right| \le \left| (-1)^{n+1} \frac{x^2}{n+1} \right| \le \frac{100}{n+1} \underset{n \to +\infty}{\to} 0$$

is true for all  $x \in (0, 10]$  simultaneously.

*Remark to Examples 30–33.* In the next four examples, we analyze the sufficient conditions of Abel's theorem for the uniform convergence of the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$ . The situation here is quite similar to that for Dirichlet's



**Figure 1.20** Examples 29 and 33, sequence  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{xn^2}$ .



**Figure 1.21** Examples 29 and 33, series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}$ .

theorem: none of the three conditions can be dropped, but, at the same time, all of them can be violated for an uniformly convergent series.

**Example 30.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges on *X*, and a sequence  $v_n(x)$  is monotone in *n* for each fixed  $x \in X$  and uniformly bounded on *X*, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

For  $u_n(x) = x^{n-1}$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$  on X = (0, 1), the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^{n-1}$  is convergent at each point  $x \in (0, 1)$ , since this is a geometric series with the ratio in (0, 1), and the sequence  $v_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$  is monotone in *n* and uniformly bounded on X:  $\left|\frac{x}{n}\right| \le \frac{1}{n} \le 1$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\forall x \in X$ . Thus, all the statement conditions are satisfied. However, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on (0, 1) (see Example 26 for details). Note, that in the statement conditions, the first condition of Abel's theorem (the uniform convergence of  $\sum u_n(x)$ ) is weakened, and the chosen series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^{n-1}$  converges nonuniformly on X = (0, 1), which can be seen from the evaluation of the series residual for  $x_n = 1 - \frac{1}{n} \in X$ ,  $\forall n > 1$ :

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} x_n^{k-1}\right| = \frac{x_n^n}{1-x_n} = n \cdot \left(1-\frac{1}{n}\right)^n \underset{n \to +\infty}{\to} \infty.$$

**Example 31.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, and a sequence  $v_n(x)$  is uniformly bounded on *X*, but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{n}$  and  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n x^n$  on X = (0, 1). The series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^n}{n}$  converges by Leibniz's test, and this convergence is uniform since  $u_n(x)$  does not depend on x. The uniform boundedness of  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n x^n$  is also easily verified:  $|(-1)^n x^n| \le 1$ , for  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\forall x \in (0, 1)$ . Thus, all the statement conditions hold. However, as was shown in Example 26, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on (0, 1). Note that the condition of monotonicity of  $v_n(x)$  in Abel's theorem is omitted in this example and, consequently, the choice of the nonmonotone sequence  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n x^n$  resulted in nonuniform convergence of the series of the products.

**Example 32.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*, and a sequence  $v_n(x)$  is monotone in *n* for each fixed  $x \in X$ , but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

For  $u_n(x) = \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}$  and  $v_n(x) = nx$  on X = (0, 1), all the statement conditions are satisfied. In fact, the sequence  $v_n(x) = nx$  is monotone in *n* for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ , and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}$  converges uniformly on (0, 1)according to the Weierstrass test:  $\left|\frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}\right| \leq \frac{1}{n^2}, \forall x \in (0, 1)$  and the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^2}$  is a convergent *p*-series. However, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{n}$  converges nonuniformly on (0, 1) (see details in Example 26). Note that the condition of uniform boundedness of  $v_n(x)$  in Abel's theorem is omitted in the statement. The chosen sequence  $v_n(x) = nx$  is not bounded for any  $x \in (0, 1)$ , and this led to nonuniform convergence of the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$ .

*Remark.* The following strengthened version of this example can also be constructed: a series  $\sum u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on X, and a sequence  $v_n(x)$  is monotone and bounded in n for each fixed  $x \in X$ , but the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on X. The counterexample can be provided by  $u_n(x) = \frac{x^2}{(1+x)^n}$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{n^2}{(3n^2+2)x}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ . The series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{(1+x)^n}$  converges on X as a geometric series with the ratio  $\frac{1}{1+x} \in (0, 1), \forall x \in X$ . To show the uniformity of this convergence on X, let us consider the residual

$$r_n(x) = \sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} \frac{x^2}{(1+x)^k} = \frac{\frac{x}{(1+x)^{n+1}}}{1 - \frac{1}{1+x}} = \frac{x}{(1+x)^n}$$

and solve the critical point equation for each n > 1 fixed:

$$r'_n(x) = \frac{1 - (n - 1)x}{(1 + x)^{n+1}} = 0$$

that gives  $x_n = \frac{1}{n-1}$ . Since the derivative  $r'_n(x)$  is positive at the left of  $x_n$  and negative at the right, the critical point  $x_n$  is the maximum on X and, consequently, for each fixed *n* one gets the following evaluation of the residual:

$$r_n(x) \le \max_{(0,+\infty)} |r_n(x)| = r_n(x_n) = \frac{1}{n-1} \left( 1 + \frac{1}{n-1} \right)^{-n} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} 0 \cdot e^{-1} = 0$$

that is, the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*. As for the sequence  $v_n(x) = \frac{n^2}{(3n^2+2)x}$ , for each fixed  $x \in X$ , its terms are monotonic  $(v_{n+1}(x) > v_n(x))$  and bounded  $(|v_n(x)| = \frac{n^2}{(3n^2+2)x} < \frac{1}{3x})$ . Thus, all the con-

ditions of the statement are satisfied. Nevertheless, the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n^2}{3n^2+2} \frac{x}{(1+x)^n}$  converges nonuniformly on *X*. Indeed, the convergence on *X* follows from the inequality  $0 < \frac{n^2}{3n^2+2} \frac{x}{(1+x)^n} < \frac{1}{3} \frac{x}{(1+x)^n}$  and the convergence of the geometric series  $\sum \frac{x}{(1+x)^n}$  for each fixed  $x \in X$ . Applying now the Cauchy criterion with  $p_n = n$  and  $x_n = \frac{1}{n}$ , one obtains

$$\left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{n+p_n} u_k(x_n) v_k(x_n)\right| = \sum_{k=n+1}^{2n} \frac{k^2}{3k^2 + 2} \frac{x_n}{(1+x_n)^k} > \frac{n}{4} \frac{x_n}{(1+x_n)^{2n}}$$
$$= \frac{n}{4} \frac{1}{n} \left(1 + \frac{1}{n}\right)^{-2n} \underset{n \to \infty}{\to} \frac{1}{4} e^{-2} \neq 0,$$

which means that the convergence is nonuniform on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ . Note that although  $v_n(x)$  is bounded for each fixed  $x \in X$ , it is not uniformly bounded on X, since for  $x_n = \frac{1}{3n^{2}+2} \in X$  one gets  $v_n(x_n) = n^2 \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} +\infty$ .

**Example 33.** A series  $\sum u_n(x)$  does not converge uniformly on X, and a sequence  $v_n(x)$  is not monotone in *n* and is not uniformly bounded on *X*, but still the series  $\sum u_n(x)v_n(x)$  converges uniformly on *X*.

#### Solution

Consider  $u_n(x) = x^n$  and  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{xn^2}$  on X = (0, 1). Let us check the conditions of the statement. First, using the same reasoning as in Example 30, one can prove that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} x^n$  converges nonuniformly on (0, 1). Then, the sequence  $v_n(x)$  is not monotone in *n* (it is alternating for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ ). Finally,  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{xn^2}$  converges to 0 for each fixed  $x \in (0, 1)$ , but this sequence does not bounded uniformly on (0, 1), since for  $x_n = \frac{1}{n^3} \in (0, 1)$  one has  $|v_n(x_n)| = n \xrightarrow[n \to +\infty]{} \infty$ . Thus, all the conditions of Abel's theorem are violated. Nevertheless, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^{n-1}}{n^2}$  converges uniformly on (0, 1) according to the Weierstrass test as was shown in Example 29.

*Remark.* The conditions of Abel's theorem are violated even stronger for the functions  $u_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$  and  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n \sqrt{nx}$  considered on X = (0, 2]. In fact, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x}{n}$  diverges at each  $x \in (0, 2]$ . The sequence  $(-1)^n \sqrt{nx}$  is not monotone in *n* and is unbounded at each  $x \in (0, 2]$  because  $|v_n(x)| = |(-1)^n \sqrt{nx}| = \sqrt{nx} \xrightarrow[n \to +\infty]{} +\infty, \ \forall x \in (0, 2]$ . Nevertheless, the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)v_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^2}{\sqrt{n}}$  converges uniformly on (0, 2] as is seen from the evaluation of the residual (following from Leibniz's test for alternating series)

$$|r_n(x)| = \left|\sum_{k=n+1}^{\infty} (-1)^k \frac{x^2}{\sqrt{k}}\right| \le \left| (-1)^{n+1} \frac{x^2}{\sqrt{n+1}} \right| \le \frac{4}{\sqrt{n+1}} \underset{n \to +\infty}{\to} 0,$$

which is satisfied for all  $x \in (0, 2]$  simultaneously.

## Exercises

- 1 Show that Example 1 can be illustrated by the sequence  $f_n(x) = \frac{nx}{n^2x^2+1}$  on X = [0, 1].
- **2** Use the points  $x_n = \frac{1}{\sqrt[n]{2}}$ ,  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$  to prove that the sequence  $f_n(x) = x^n$  of Example 1 converges nonuniformly on X = (-1, 1).
- **3** Show that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 2^n \sin \frac{1}{5^n x}$  converges on  $X = (0, \infty)$ , but the convergence is not uniform.
- 4 Check if the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{x^n}{\sqrt[3]{n}}$  on X = (-1, 1) can be used for Example 2.
- **5** Use the sequence  $f_n(x) = \frac{x+n+(-1)^n x}{n^2}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$  to illustrate the statement in Example 3.
- **6** Construct a counterexample to the following false statement: "if f(x, y) defined on  $[a, b] \times Y$  converges to a limit function  $\varphi(x)$  as y approaches  $y_0$ , and this convergence is uniform on any interval [c, b],  $\forall c \in (a, b)$ , then the convergence is also uniform on [a, b]." Compare with the statement in Example 4. Formulate similar false statements for sequences and series and disprove them by counterexamples. (Hint: for the functions depending on a parameter, try  $f(x, y) = \frac{2xy^2}{x^2+y^4}$  on  $[0, 1] \times (0, 1]$  with the limit point  $y_0 = 0$ ; for the sequences— $f_n(x) = \frac{nx}{n^2x^2+1}$  on [0, 1]; and for the series— $\sum u_n(x) = \sum \frac{(1-x)^n}{n}$  on (0, 1].)

- 7 Verify that
  - a) the function  $f(x, y) = \frac{x^2}{y^2} e^{-x/y}$  on  $X \times Y = [0, +\infty) \times (0, 1]$  with the limit point  $y_0 = 0$
  - b) the function  $f(x, y) = \begin{cases} \frac{x}{y} \sin \frac{y}{x}, & x \neq 0 \\ 1, & x = 0 \end{cases}$  on  $X \times Y = \mathbb{R} \times (0, 1]$  with the limit point  $y_0 = 0$

c) the sequence 
$$f_n(x) = \frac{2n^2x}{1+x^4x^2}$$
 on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ 

- d) the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ provide counterexamples for Example 5.
- 8 Verify that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n \frac{x^2 + n^2}{n^3}$  on X = [-1, 1] is one more counterexample to the statement of Example 7.
- **9** Use the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^{n-1} \frac{x^n}{2}$ , X = (-1, 1) for Example 8.
- Show the feasibility of Example 9 by using counterexamples with a) the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^{n-1} \frac{x^2}{(1+x^2)^n}$ ,  $X = \mathbb{R}$ b) the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (-1)^n x (1-x)^n$ , X = [0,1]. 10

11 Use the series 
$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} u_n(x)$$
 with  
a)  $u_n(x) = \begin{cases} 0, x \in [0, 3^{-n-1}] \cup [3^{-n}, 1] \\ \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \cos^2 \left( \frac{3^{n+1}}{2} \pi x \right), x \in (3^{-n-1}, 3^{-n}) \end{cases}$  on  $X = [0, 1]$   
b)  $u_n(x) = (-1)^{n-1} \frac{x^2}{(1+x^2)^n}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$   
to show the feasibility of Example 10.

12 Verify that the sequence 
$$f_n(x) = \frac{x^2 n^2}{2n^2 + 5}$$
 on  $X = (0, 1]$  specifies Example 15.

Check the statement of Example 16 for the sequence  $f_n(x) = \frac{2nx}{x^2 + x^2}$  on 13  $X = \mathbb{R}.$ 

**14** Verify whether the sequences  $f_n(x)$ ,  $g_n(x)$  and  $f_n(x) \cdot g_n(x)$  are convergent or divergent on *X*. In the case of the convergence, analyze its character: a)  $f_n(x) = \ln \frac{(n^2+1)x}{n^2}$ ,  $g_n(x) = \ln \frac{3n+2}{n}x^2$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ b)  $f_n(x) = m r_{n^2}$ ,  $g_n(x) = m r_n$ ,  $x \in O(X) = 0$ b)  $f_n(x) = g_n(x) = \ln \frac{n^2 x^2}{n^2 + 1}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ c)  $f_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$ ,  $g_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{nx}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ d)  $f_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$ ,  $g_n(x) = \ln \frac{(n+1)x}{n}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ e)  $f_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$ ,  $g_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{nx}$  on X = (0, 1]f)  $f_n(x) = g_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{5n^2 + 2}{3n^2 + 1} x$  on X = (0, 1].

Formulate false statements for which these sequences represent counterexamples.

- **15** Show that the sequences  $f_n(x) = \begin{cases} \frac{n^2+1}{n^2} x^2, x \in \mathbb{Q} \\ \frac{x^2}{n^2}, x \in \mathbb{I} \end{cases}$  and  $g_n(x) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{n^2} x^2, x \in \mathbb{Q} \\ \frac{n^2+1}{n^2} x^2, x \in \mathbb{I} \end{cases}$  defined on X = [0,1] provide a counterexample to Example 14.
- **16** Verify whether the series  $\sum u_n(x)$ ,  $\sum v_n(x)$  and  $\sum u_n(x) \cdot v_n(x)$  are convergent or divergent on *X*. In the case of the convergence, analyze its character:
  - a)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ b)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{n^{2/3}}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ c)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{1}{x^{2/3} + n^{2/3}}$  on  $X = [0, +\infty)$ d)  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{x+n}, v_n(x) = \frac{1}{x+\ln^2 n}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ e)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{\cos nx}{\sqrt{n}}$  on  $X = [a, \pi - a], \forall a \in \left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right)$ f)  $u_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt{n}}, v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{\sqrt[4]{n}}$  on  $X = [a, \pi - a], \forall a \in \left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right)$ g)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = (0, 1)h)  $u_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\ln n}, v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}, n \ge 2$  on X = (0, 1)i)  $u_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{n^{2/3}}, v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{n}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ j)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{x^n}{n}$  on X = [0, 1)k)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = \frac{x^n}{n}$  on X = [0, 1)l)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1)j)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^n}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1)k)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1)l)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1)k)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1)m)  $u_n(x) = v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x}{\sqrt{n}}$  on X = [0, 1). Formulate false statements for which these series represent counterexamples.
- **17** Show that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{2x^3}{n^6 + x^6}$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{2x^3}{n^6 + x^3}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$  exemplify the statement in Example 25.
- 18 For given u<sub>n</sub>(x) and v<sub>n</sub>(x) on the specified set X, verify the conditions of Dirichlet's theorem and investigate the character of the convergence of the series ∑ u<sub>n</sub>(x) · v<sub>n</sub>(x):
  a) u<sub>n</sub>(x) = x<sup>n-1</sup>, v<sub>n</sub>(x) = x/n on X = (-1, 1)
  b) u<sub>n</sub>(x) = x<sup>n-1</sup>, v<sub>n</sub>(x) = (-1)<sup>n</sup> x/n on X = [0, 1)
  c) u<sub>n</sub>(x) = x<sup>n+1</sup>, v<sub>n</sub>(x) = (-1)<sup>n</sup> 1/n<sup>3/2</sup>x on X = (0, 1)

d) 
$$u_n(x) = (-1)^n x^{n-1}$$
,  $v_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x}{n}$  on  $X = [0, 1)$   
e)  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$ ,  $v_n(x) = \sin nx$  on  $X = \left[\frac{\pi}{10}, \frac{19\pi}{10}\right]$   
f)  $u_n(x) = (-1)^n$ ,  $v_n(x) = \left(\frac{x^2}{1+x^2}\right)^n$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$   
g)  $u_n(x) = x^2$ ,  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{(1+x^2)^n}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$   
h)  $u_n(x) = \frac{x}{n}$ ,  $v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{x}$  on  $X = \left[\frac{\pi}{6}, \frac{11\pi}{6}\right]$   
i)  $u_n(x) = x^{2n}$ ,  $v_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{(1+x^2)^n}$  on  $X = (-1, 1)$ .  
Formulate false statements for which these functions at

rmulate talse statements for which these functions and series represent counterexamples.

**19** For given  $u_n(x)$  and  $v_n(x)$  on the specified set *X*, verify the conditions of Abel's theorem and investigate the character of the convergence of the series  $\sum u_n(x) \cdot v_n(x)$ :

a) 
$$u_n(x) = (-1)^n$$
,  $v_n(x) = \left(\frac{x^2}{1+x^2}\right)^n$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$   
b)  $u_n(x) = x^{n-1}$ ,  $v_n(x) = \frac{x}{2}$  on  $X = (-1, 1)$ 

b) 
$$u_n(x) = x^{n-1}, v_n(x) = \frac{\pi}{n}$$
 on  $X = (-1, 1)$ 

- c)  $u_n(x) = \frac{x^2}{n}, v_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{nx^2}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ d)  $u_n(x) = \frac{1}{nx}, v_n(x) = \sqrt{nx} \sin nx$  on  $X = \left[\frac{\pi}{10}, \frac{19\pi}{10}\right]$ e)  $u_n(x) = \frac{(-1)^n}{n}, v_n(x) = (-1)^n \sin nx$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ f)  $u_n(x) = (-1)^n \frac{x^2}{(1+x^2)^n}, v_n(x) = \frac{2n+1}{(n+1)x^2}$  on  $X = (0, +\infty)$ g)  $u_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{2}, v_n(x) = \frac{1}{2}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$

g) 
$$u_n(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}, v_n(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}}$$
 on  $X = \mathbb{R}$ 

h) 
$$u_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{n^2}$$
,  $v_n(x) = n^{3/2}$  on  $X = \mathbb{R}$   
i)  $u_n(x) = \frac{x^n}{n^2}$ ,  $u_n(x) = \frac{\pi \sqrt{n}}{n}$  or  $X = (0, 1)$ 

1) 
$$u_n(x) = \frac{1}{n\sqrt{n}}, v_n(x) = x\sqrt{n} \text{ on } X = (0, 1)$$

j) 
$$u_n(x) = \frac{\sin nx}{n}, v_n(x) = (-1)^n \sqrt{n}$$
 on  $X = \left(0, \frac{\pi}{2}\right).$ 

Formulate false statements for which these functions and series represent counterexamples.

# **Further Reading**

- S. Abbott. Understanding Analysis, Springer, New York, 2002.
- D. Bressoud, A Radical Approach to Real Analysis, MAA, Washington, DC, 2007.
- T.J.I. Bromwich, An Introduction to the Theory of Infinite Series, AMS, Providence, RI, 2005.
- B.M. Budak and S.V. Fomin, Multiple Integrals, Field Theory and Series, Mir Publisher, Moscow, 1978.

- G.M. Fichtengolz, *Differential- und Integralrechnung, Vol.1–3*, V.E.B. Deutscher Verlag Wiss., Berlin, 1968.
- V.A. Ilyin and E.G. Poznyak, *Fundamentals of Mathematical Analysis, Vol.1,2*, Mir Publisher, Moscow, 1982.
- K. Knopp, *Theory and Applications of Infinite Series*, Dover Publication, Mineola, NY, 1990.
- C.H.C. Little, K.L. Teo and B. Brunt, *Real Analysis via Sequences and Series*, Springer, New York, 2015.
- W. Rudin, Principles of Mathematical Analysis, McGraw-Hill, New York, 1976.
- V.A. Zorich, Mathematical Analysis I, II, Springer, Berlin, 2004.